Death in Byzantium

GEORGE T. DENNIS

For the Byzantines, as for us, the sun rises each morning and sets each evening. But they also believed that there would come one day, for each individual as well as for the whole of creation, which would not have an evening—the day without an evening, $\dot{\eta}$ ἀνέσπερος $\dot{\eta}$ μέρα. And this may help us understand how the Byzantine people looked upon what we call death.

There is one way in which we enter this world, but many ways in which we leave it. In reflecting on the deaths of emperors, Niketas Choniates observed that God does not like to direct human affairs in the same manner all the time but prefers some variety.² Thus one ruler is drowned, another decapitated, another killed by the enemy, still another gone mad and left to die in oblivion, while others "cross over to the other side as though they had simply closed their eyes in sleep." Of the eighty-eight emperors who ruled, from the first Constantine to the twelfth of that name, thirty-seven died natural deaths, three died in accidents, five in battle, thirty by other forms of violence, and thirteen were forced to abdicate and enter a monastery, regarded as another kind of death. Clearly, though, our concern is not limited to emperors, for death came, suddenly or slowly, to men and women of all classes and of all ages in the Byzantine world.

Death, the Byzantine people heard in church, was a consequence of sin, and, in addition to their daily experience of it, they were advised to reflect constantly on the transitory nature of this life.³ Monks and nuns, in particular, were called to meditate on death. Typical is the exhortation by Symeon the New Theologian to his monks, "On the Remembrance of Death." The sixth rung on the Ladder of Paradise of John Klimakos bears the same title: "On the Remembrance of Death."

Several instances of death, as recorded in our sources, may teach us something about Byzantine attitudes regarding that eventuality. At the beginning, however, we should note that the Byzantines were certain that death was not the end; the sources give almost no indication of disbelief in an afterlife. We may also note that, except in very rare circum-

¹See St. Basil, In Hexaem., 2, PG 29:52A; John of Damascus, Carmen in Pascha, PG 96:844B; The Letters of Manuel II Palaeologus, ed. G. Dennis, CFHB 8 (Washington, D.C., 1977), ep. 31.97, p. 85. Cf. St. Augustine, Confessions, 13, 35–36.

²Nicetae Choniatae Historia, ed. J. L. van Dieten, CFHB 11 (Berlin, 1975), p. 424, 33-46.

³See Genesis 3; Romans 5:12.

⁴Catéchèses, ed. B. Krivocheine, 3 vols. (Paris, 1963–65); English trans. C. J. de Catanzaro, *The Discourses* (New York-Toronto, 1980), disc. 21.

⁵Ioannis Climaci, Scala Paradisi, PG 88:793.

stances, they did not practice embalming or cremation.⁶ Moreover, because of the imprecise nature of so many of our sources, what is presented here must be largely anecdotal.

Like us, the Byzantines tended to avoid the words *death* and *dying*. They preferred various euphemisms. A person had simply "gone away," had vanished or departed from the world of mortals or was no longer among them.⁷ Emperor Constantine VII "exchanged his life and was free to rest over there." A person fulfilled "our common debt"; he completed or, in one instance, emptied his quiver of his allotted portion of life. One freed oneself from the things here. Individuals were "cut down like a shoot by the sickle of death." In 1411 a Turkish prince "met an end quite worthy of his ways"; he was strangled by his brother. Some soldiers who fell in battle "embraced mother earth," and others "added to the population of Hades." Soldiers falling from a battlement demolished by Byzantine artillery "were pitched headlong into the entranceway of Hades... and were soon woefully swimming across Acheron." In another siege, the wall collapsed and the men on it "failed to answer roll call."

In a letter to Tsar Symeon of Bulgaria, Patriarch Nicholas I made this observation: "Human life is unstable. It is not only the old, such as myself, who are taken by death. Many who are in their prime fall to death's sickle." 16 Old for the Byzantines meant fifty to sixty years of age, with seventy and beyond being regarded as extreme old age, but, because of the high rate of infant mortality, it has been calculated that the average life expectancy in Byzantium was about thirty-five years.¹⁷ Of the major imperial families, the Macedonians averaged a life span of fifty-nine years, although Basil II lived to seventytwo, his brother Constantine VIII to seventy, and his niece Theodora to seventy-six; the Komnenoi averaged sixty-one years, and the Palaiologoi sixty.¹⁸ Andronikos II lived to the age of seventy-two and his great-grandson Manuel to seventy-five. Literary figures and scholars seem to have lived long lives, many attaining the biblical three score and ten (Psalm 90 [89]:10), and some, like Demetrios Kydones, hypochondriac though he was, living well beyond that. Monastic saints, who professed to despise this life, seem to have clung to it longer than others, many living into their eighties and nineties, and the hermits outlasted all of them, with St. Antony supposedly dying at 105 years of age and St. Paul, the first hermit, at 113.

```
<sup>6</sup>P. Koukoules, Byzantinon bios kai politismos, 6 vols. (Athens, 1948–57), 4:193–94.
```

⁷E.g., Leonis diaconi historiae libri X [Leo the Deacon], ed. C. B. Hase (Bonn, 1828), bk. 2, chap. 10, p. 31.7; Nicholas I Patriarch of Constantinople, Letters, ed. R. J. Jenkins and L. G. Westerink, CFHB 6 (Washington, D.C., 1973), ep. 1.161–62, p. 10; Choniates, Historia, 51, 79; Manuel, Letters, ep. 56.3, p. 159.

⁸Leo the Deacon, bk. 1, chap. 2, p. 6.2.

⁹Ioannis Skylitzae synopsis historiarum, ed. I. Thurn, CFHB 5 (Berlin-New York, 1973), 80.75; Choniates, Historia, 38.

¹⁰Manuel, Letters, ep. 1.17, p. 3.

¹¹Nicholas, *Letters*, ep. 156.35, p. 476.

¹²Manuel, *Letters*, ep. 57.9–10, p. 161.

¹³Eustazio di Tessalonica, La espugnazione di Tessalonica, ed. S. Kyriakidis, trans. V. Rotolo (Palermo, 1961); Greek text reprinted with English trans. by J. Melville-Jones, Eustathios of Thessaloniki. The Capture of Thessaloniki (Canberra, 1988), p. 106, 1, p. 148.

¹⁴Choniates, Historia, 134.

¹⁵Leo the Deacon, bk. 3, chap. 11, p. 53.12.

¹⁶Nicholas, Letters, ep. 24.31-35, p. 168.

¹⁷See A.-M. Talbot, "Old Age in Byzantium," BZ 77 (1984): 267-78, esp. 268.

¹⁸ Ibid., 269.

In general, though, death came to the Byzantines early. Theodore of Stoudios, for example, wrote to console Leo the *orphanotrophos*, whose first two sons had died as babies, only to have another son die at three years of age.19 The mortality rate for the first five years seems to have been about fifty percent, although reliable statistics are unattainable. St. Mary the Younger had four sons, two of whom died before their fifth birthday.²⁰ In a village in Macedonia, about the year 1300, thirty-two babies were born; eight died within a year and another eight within five years.²¹ In the collection of military treatises in the codex Mediceo-Laurentianus 55, 4, Demetrios Laskaris Leontares recorded births and deaths in his family. Between 1407 and 1434, twelve children were born to him (seven boys and five girls), and seven of these died in childhood (four boys and three girls).²² Chances of survival after one's fifth birthday may have been better, but, even among the wealthier families who had access to better health care, death came at every age. The son of Emperor John VII Palaiologos, Andronikos, died at seven years of age and Michael Psellos' daughter, Styliane, at nine.²³ Anna Komnene bewailed the death of her brother who was so young and in the most charming time of life. 24 In 1142, Alexios, the thirty-sixyear-old son of Emperor John Komnenos, died of a rushing fever in his head, and his second son, Andronikos, died suddenly while escorting his brother's body to Constantinople.25 Consider the progeny of Basil I; he had at least five sons and four daughters, but only one surviving grandson, and three generations later his direct posterity died out. In the prime of life the invincible hero of the borderlands, Digenes Akritas, fell ill; he called in an army doctor who declared the illness fatal, and the next day, "folding his hands cross-wise, the noble youth surrendered his soul to the angels of the Lord."26

When the time came, one hoped to die surrounded by one's family and strengthened by the sacraments of the church, perhaps with the eucharist on one's tongue, and such tranquil deaths are recorded in our sources. Saints, of course, could predict the hour of their death, and pious Christians, whose reckoning was less exact, tried to plan ahead, sometimes by founding a monastery, in which prayers would be said for their souls, often by taking a monastic name and being clothed in the monastic habit before dying. St. Philaretos the Merciful made detailed preparations for his final hour; he paid for a tomb in the convent of Krisis, assembled his children and grandchildren and spoke with each of them.²⁷ The blissful deaths of saintly monks and nuns, often surrounded by their disciples, conclude many a *vita*. But not all were so blessed. The violent and painful deaths of some, both saints and sinners, are reported either to edify the reader or to instill salutary fear, the horrendous martyrdom of St. Stephen the Younger and the ghastly

¹⁹Theodori Studitae Epistulae, ed. G. Fatouros, 2. vols. CFHB 31 (Berlin, 1992), ep. 29; see also ep. 18.

²⁰AASS, Nov. 4 (Brussels, 1925), 692–705; English trans. by A Laiou in *Holy Women of Byzantium*, ed. A. M. Talbot (Washington, D.C., 1996), 239–83, esp. 258–61.

²¹A. Laiou-Thomadakis, Peasant Society in the Late Byzantine Empire (Princeton, N.J., 1977), 294-96.

²² Fol. 253v; see A. M. Bandini, Catalogus codicum mss. Bibliothecae Mediceae Laurentianae, 3 vols. (Florence, 1764–70), 2:218–38.

²³G. Dennis, "An Unknown Byzantine Emperor, Andronicus V Palaeologus (1400–1407)," JÖBG 16 (1967): 175–87; Michael Psellos, Funeral Oration on His Daughter, ed. K. Sathas, Μεσαιωνική Βιβλιοθήκη, vol. 5 (Paris, 1876), 62–87.

²⁴Anne Comnène Alexiade, ed. and trans. B. Leib, 3 vols. (Paris, 1937–43), 15, 5, 4; vol. 3, p. 206, 3–10.

²⁵Choniates, Historia, 38; Kinnamos, Epitome, ed. A. Meineke (Bonn, 1836), p. 27.

²⁶Digenis Akritas, ed. and trans. E. Jeffreys (Cambridge, 1998), bk. 8, pp. 218-20, 226.

²⁷M. H. Fourmy and M. Leroy, "La vie de s. Philarète," Byzantion 9 (1934): 85-170, esp. 151-55.

punishment of the woman who betrayed him being good examples.²⁸ Stressful in its own way was the death of Alexios I in the Mangana monastery, where he had gone for medical care; while he "directed his gaze upon the angels who would lead his soul to the next world," his wife and children fought bitterly about the succession.²⁹

Diseases of all sorts were endemic in the Byzantine world and, despite relatively advanced medical care, more often than not proved fatal. Historians such as Anna Komnene and Michael Psellos delight in giving pathological observations in clinical detail. The lives of saints and miracle tales also furnish abundant medical information about diseases and afflictions which were ordinarily incurable. Even in the great cities, with their aqueducts and sewers, poor sanitation and, at times, scarcity of food contributed to the general mortality, not only of the poor but of wealthier citizens as well. And, of course, when the plague struck, death was ubiquitous and quotidian. Injuries, whether incurred in one's house or outdoors, easily led to infection and death. One need only recall the terrible death of John Komnenos, who had accidentally cut his hand on a poisoned arrow, described in agonizing detail by Choniates.³⁰

Then, as now, accidents were a major cause of death. Members of the upper classes might suffer fatal injuries while hunting or on a wild horseback ride, while other citizens might be run over and crushed by wagon wheels or fall off a ladder. Even a saint might meet with a fatal accident, as did Athanasios of Athos while supervising the reconstruction of a church.³¹ The workplace was full of hazards; again, saints' lives and miracle tales are very informative. Indeed, one could probably rely on the *vitae* of the saints to compile an essay on industrial accidents in Byzantium.³²

Violence, of course, begot death. We may note, however, that violence against oneself, suicide, is rarely attested in the sources.³³ In the cities, especially in the capital, one might fall victim to the armed robbers and murderers who lurked in the alleys. And the countryside was swarming with cutthroats. "No matter where one goes," Kydones complained, "mountains or plains, bandits are lying in wait." Domestic violence and child abuse, then as now, went largely unreported. But we read of St. Thomais of Lesbos who died after repeated beatings by her husband and of an earlier St. Thomais, of Alexandria, who was beaten to death by her father-in-law.³⁵ Then, too, thousands of deaths might result from periodic outbreaks of urban violence, such as the Nika riots in Constantinople in 532 or the so-called Zealot uprising in Thessalonike in the 1340s. Violent death, as mentioned above, did not spare even the emperors. As he joined in singing the liturgical hymns on

²⁸La vie d'Etienne le Jeune par Etienne le diacre, ed. and trans. M. F. Auzépy (Aldershot, 1997), pp. 169–70, 174–75.

²⁹Choniates, *Historia*, 6–8; Anna Komnene offers a different version: *Alexiade*, 15, 11; vol. 3, pp. 229–41.

³⁰Choniates, Historia, 40-41.

³¹Vitae duae antiquae sancti Athanasii Athonitae, ed. J. Noret (Turnhout, 1982), pp. 112–14.

³²On dangers faced by construction workers see R. Ousterhout, *Master Builders of Byzantium* (Princeton, N.J., 1999).

³³Theodore of Stoudios mentions suicides: epp. 449, 462. A defeated Turkish officer killed himself in 1085: *Alexiade*, 6, 9, 3; vol. 2, p. 65, 18–22. The debt-ridden scribe Melitas hanged himself in 1303: *Georgii Pachymeris De Michaele et Andronico Palaeologis libri XIII*, ed. I. Bekker (Bonn, 1835), 2:385–88. See *ODB* 3:1974–75.

³⁴Démétrius Cydonès Correspondance, ed. R. J. Loenertz, 2 vols., ST 186, 208 (Vatican City, 1956–60), ep. 264.55–64; vol. 2, p. 175.

³⁵See BHG 3, p. 77; also Talbot, Holy Women (as above, note 20), 291-95.

Christmas morning in 820, Leo V was brutally stabbed by conspirators wearing clerical vestments.³⁶ A drunken Michael III was murdered by his co-emperor Basil in September 867.³⁷ Who can forget the cruel murder of Nikephoros Phokas as he lay asleep on a leopard skin on his bedroom floor?³⁸ Recall too the horrible drawn-out murder of Andronikos I by a blood-crazed mob and that of Romanos III in his bath.³⁹

While the Byzantines faced constant dangers on land, they were even more afraid of the sea.⁴⁰ Tidal waves might inundate their coastal villages, and to board a ship was to risk certain death. Violent tempests might arise without warning and sink the stoutest ship with all hands. St. Gregory the Decapolite prayed that a monk whose small boat had capsized "would not become a victim of the sea and take up residence in the briny depths." In addition to shipwreck, moreover, passengers and crew might suffer a cruel death or be sold into slavery by the pirates who infested the sea-lanes. Finally, the Byzantines were terrified by the denizens of the deep, real and imaginary. A disobedient monk, for example, went fishing and was attacked by a huge shark, which would have quickly devoured him if St. Niphon had not been praying for him; this was not an ordinary shark but the devil in disguise. The Byzantines were reminded of all this by portrayals of the last judgment, such as the one in Torcello, which depict the sea monsters spitting out all those who had died at sea.

Death, of course, always accompanied the Byzantine armies. As with all premodern armies, there were probably more deaths from disease than from combat. Army doctors were advised that they had to be able to deal with the consequences of soldiers' eating unripe fruit as well as with their wounds. 44 Casualties in pitched battles were always high, especially among troops pursued or surrounded by a victorious enemy. The slaughter in 811 of the Hikanatoi regiment, composed of sons of army officers, is particularly poignant: "handsome young soldiers in the bloom of manhood, some just recently married, all horribly killed." 45 And the Byzantines never forgot the forty-two military officers and civilians taken prisoner at Amorion in 838, who were brutally tortured and killed in captivity. 46

Wounds received in combat, especially in the head and torso, were almost invariably mortal. In the desperate battle against the Bulgarians in July 811, the emperor's son Staurakios was severely wounded in the lower back; taken to the capital, he died in agony two months later.⁴⁷ Death was caused by showers of arrows and by stones hurled by artil-

```
<sup>36</sup>Skylitzes, 22.29–23.56.
```

³⁷Skylitzes, 114.50.

³⁸Leo the Deacon, bk. 5, chap. 7; pp. 87–88.

³⁹Choniates, *Historia*, 349–51; Michael Psellos, *Chronography*, 3, 26: *Michele Psello*, *Imperatori di Bisanzio*, ed. S. Impellizzeri, 2 vols. (Milan, 1984), 1:110–12.

⁴⁰See G. Dennis, "Perils of the Deep," in *Novum Millennium*. Studies in Byzantine History and Culture in Honor of Paul Speck, ed. C. Sode and S. Takács (Aldershot, 2000), 65–74.

⁴¹Ignatios Diakonos und die Vita des Hl. Gregorios Dekapolites, ed. G. Makris, ByzArch 17 (Stuttgart-Leipzig, 1997), chap. 12.

⁴²See Dennis, "Perils of the Deep," 71–72.

⁴³ F. Halkin, "La vie de s. Niphon, ermite au mont Athos (XIVe s.)," AB 58 (1940): 1–27, esp. 18.

⁴⁴Leonis imperatoris Tactica, ed. R. Vári, 2 vols. (Budapest, 1917–22), bks. 1–14, 38; complete in PG 107: 669–1120, Epil. 63: PG 107: 1089D.

⁴⁵I. Dujčev, "La chronique byzantine de l'an 811," TM 1 (1965): 205–54, esp. 214.70–77.

⁴⁶Skazaniia o 42 amoriiskikh muchenikakh, ed. V. Vasil'evskii and P. Nikitin (St. Petersburg, 1905).

⁴⁷Theophanis Chronographia, ed. C. de Boor, vol. 1 (Leipzig, 1883), A.M. 6303, p. 492.

lery. An analysis of Komnenian battles shows that lances accounted for about twenty percent of the soldiers killed or incapacitated; since these were used primarily in the initial charge, it meant that one-fifth of the casualties fell in the first two or three minutes of battle. And once battle had been joined, death spared nobody. Nikephoros Ouranos pictures the moment of impact: "the *kataphraktoi* will smash in the heads and bodies of the enemy with their iron maces and sabers . . . and so completely destroy them." The chronicles abound in descriptions of swords cleaving skulls and chests skewered by lances. Moreover, one did not have to be struck by a weapon to perish on the battlefield. In 989, Bardas Phokas tried to rally his troops, but seized by a stroke of some sort, he fell off his horse dead. In the spring of 1086, the Domestic Pakourianos led a fierce and desperate charge against the Pechenegs and "slammed into an oak tree and died on the spot." In the spot." In the spot." In the spring of 1086, the Domestic Pakourianos led a fierce and desperate charge against the Pechenegs and "slammed into an oak tree and died on the spot." In the spot." In the spot." In the spring of 1086, the Domestic Pakourianos led a fierce and desperate charge against the Pechenegs and "slammed into an oak tree and died on the spot." In the spring of 1086, the Domestic Pakourianos led a fierce and desperate charge against the Pechenegs and "slammed into an oak tree and died on the spot." In the spring of 1086, the Domestic Pakourianos led a fierce and desperate charge against the Pechenegs and "slammed into an oak tree and died on the spot." In the spring of 1086, the Domestic Pakourianos led a fierce and desperate charge against the Pechenegs and "slammed into an oak tree and died on the spot." In the spring of 1086, the Domestic Pakourianos led a fierce and desperate charge against the Pecheneges and "slammed into an oak tree and died on the spot."

Medieval military commanders usually aimed at the complete destruction of the enemy, that is, capturing or killing every one of them. The Byzantines, although engaging in their share of slaughter, took a different view. War was "the worst of evils," and they resorted to it only when all other means of obtaining their objectives had been exhausted, and even then they tried to avoid a frontal assault.⁵² For the killing it entailed, even in a "just war," was still evil—one need only recall the canon of St. Basil which refused communion for three years to soldiers who killed in battle.⁵³ Unless the cause was clearly just, Leo VI decreed, Byzantine commanders were not to take up arms against other peoples and were not "to stain the ground with the blood of your own people or of the barbarians."⁵⁴ The victories of Nikephoros Ouranos that most impressed his contemporaries were those achieved without bloodshed.⁵⁵ When an officer urged that the Scythian prisoners be put to death, Alexios Komnenos reprimanded him: "Even though they are Scythians, still they are human beings."⁵⁶

As with other peoples, capital punishment had its place in Byzantine life and was mandated or permitted for certain crimes.⁵⁷ The historical sources describe a good number of public executions, sometimes in gruesome detail. Criminals and rebels were dispatched with the sword, hung on a forked pole or, on occasion, impaled. In 823, the rebel Thomas was paraded on an ass through the army with his hands and feet cut off.⁵⁸ Three centuries later, the Bogomil leader Boris was burned at the stake, much to the

⁴⁸J. Birkenmeier, "Military Medicine and Injury in Byzantium," in *Textbook of Military Medicine*, vol. 2, *Military Medicine before the Modern Era* (Washington, D.C., 2000).

⁴⁹E. McGeer, Sowing the Dragon's Teeth. Byzantine Warfare in the Tenth Century (Washington, D.C., 1995), p. 128, 210–14.

⁵⁰Skylitzes, 337.12–30.

⁵¹ Alexiade, 6, 14, 3; vol. 2, p. 83, 9–12.

⁵²G. Dennis, *Three Byzantine Military Treatises* (Washington, D.C., 1985), 20–21.

⁵³ Sainte Basile, Lettres, ed. Y. Courtonne, vol. 2 (Paris, 1961), ep. 188.13, p. 130.

⁵⁴Leo VI, *Tactika*, 2, 44–46.

⁵⁵Epistoliers byzantines du Xe siècle, ed. J. Darrouzès (Paris, 1960), 258–59.

⁵⁶Alexiade, 8, 6, 1; vol. 2, p. 144, 15–17.

⁵⁷Murder, rape, incest, pederasty, robbery, arson, mutiny, treason, espionage, apostasy, magic, sorcery, heresy. See B. Singowitz, "Die Tötungsdelikte im Reich der Ekloge Leons III. des Isauriers," ZSavRom 74 (1957): 319–36.

⁵⁸Skylitzes, 40, 57.

delight of Anna Komnene.⁵⁹ It must be said, however, that the Byzantine attitude toward the death penalty differed from other societies of the time and may well be of some relevance today. The Byzantines, so it seems, preferred to sentence a guilty person to exile or to confinement in a monastery or else to subject him to mutilation or blinding rather than put that person to death. Sometimes, of course, such punishments did result in death, but, cruel though they may have been, they did allow the condemned person time to repent and to serve as a cautionary example to those who might be thinking of crime or rebellion. About 821, Patriarch Nikephoros I called upon Emperor Michael II to execute Paulician sectaries, and the emperor then proceeded to behead vast numbers of them until compelled to stop because of the vehement protests of Theodore of Stoudios who argued that, if given time, they might return to orthodoxy.⁶⁰ Michael Psellos praised Constantine X because in his nearly eight years as emperor (1059-67) no one was ever put to death, even for the most heinous crimes.⁶¹ It is recorded that throughout his much longer reign (1118-43) John Komnenos "deprived no one of life or inflicted bodily injury of any kind."62 This reluctance to take a person's life, even when legally and morally permissible, is exceptional in the history of mankind and surely merits further study. For it was not until well into the second half of the twentieth century that such sentiments were forcefully expressed and received broad support.

Emphasis on the Byzantine respect for life is one unexpected result of this cursory research on death. What about death itself? First, and perhaps merely parenthetically, we may note that the Byzantines never developed a cult of the dead, as did other peoples. Although they venerated relics of the saints and observed anniversaries of the departed, there was not that obsessive fascination with the material reminders of death that came into prominence in the West in the late Middle Ages and which in various forms have lasted into modern times: the "dance of death," the representation and display of skeletons, and the observance of "days of the dead" by the graveside. The Byzantines would not have understood the American Halloween. How, then, may one articulate, even in a very general way, the Byzantine attitude toward death? Demetrios Kydones, continuing a millennial Greek philosophical tradition, composed a treatise to demonstrate that fear of death was not rational.⁶³ The ordinary Byzantine came to somewhat the same conclusion on less theoretical grounds. Everyone was certain to meet with death. "Indeed," Theodore of Stoudios wrote, "we will proceed along the same road which our parents have traveled before us."64 The only reason for fear was if one was not prepared. Death was not the end of life but a change of life. As life itself was a journey, so death was a journey. If you had packed the necessary provisions and if your documents were in order, then you had nothing to fear and you would arrive safely at your new destination.

Washington, D.C.

⁵⁹Alexiade, 15, 10; vol. 3, pp. 226-29.

⁶⁰Theodore of Stoudios, epp. 94, 445; cf. P. Alexander, *The Patriarch Nicephorus of Constantinople* (Oxford, 1958), 99.

⁶¹ Chronography, 7a, 4, ed. Impellizzeri, 2:296.

⁶²Choniates, Historia, 47.

⁶³Demetrii Cydonii De contemnenda morte oratio, ed. H. Deckelmann (Leipzig, 1901).

⁶⁴Theodore of Stoudios, ep. 509.22–24.